

Minutes of the Closed Meeting on June 28-30, 2010

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Science Advisory Board (SAB) Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards Committee (STAA)

Date and Time: Monday, June 28, 2010, 8:30 A.M. – 5:00 P.M. Eastern, Tuesday, June 29, 2010, 8:00 A.M. – 5:00 P.M. Eastern, and Wednesday, June 30, 2010, 8:00 A.M. – 11:20 A.M. Eastern

Location: Park Hyatt Washington Hotel, 24th and M Streets NW, Washington DC, 20037

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to allow the Committee to review papers nominated for the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards and to discuss possible improvements to the process and program.

Participants:

SAB 2009-2011 STAA Committee (See Roster, Attachment A):

Dr. T. Taylor Eighmy, Chair
Dr. James Bus
Dr. Peter Chapman
Dr. John P. Giesy
Dr. Cynthia M. Harris
Dr. Dale Hattis
Dr. Michael T. Kleinman
Dr. Wayne Landis
Dr. Desmond F. Lawler
Reid Lifset
Dr. Randy Maddalena
Dr. Paulette Middleton
Dr. Fred J. Miller
Dr. John R. Smith
Dr. Robert Twiss
Dr. Yousheng Zeng
Dr. Barbara Zielinska

Meeting Summary

The meeting was announced in the Federal Register¹. A summary of the meeting follows.

EPA's Office of Research and Development (ORD) submitted a total of 145 nominations comprised of 214 papers in 14 science and technology categories for review by the SAB STAA Committee for the 2010 STAA awards.

The fourteen topical categories and total number of nominations per category that were submitted to the Committee for review were:

- Control Systems and Technology – 9
- Energy and the Environment - 2
- Ecological Research – 22
- Health Effects Research and Human Health Risk Assessment - 32
- Homeland Security – 3
- Industry and the Environment - 3
- Integrated Risk Assessment – 5
- Monitoring and Measurement Methods - 10
- Other Environmental Research – 7
- Review Articles - 13
- Risk Management and Ecosystem Restoration – 4
- Transport and Fate – 18
- Environmental Policy and Decisionmaking Studies – 1
- EPA Project and Research Reports - 17

In the weeks prior to the meeting, Committee Members reviewed the nominations and reported their initial recommendations to the Designated Federal Officer (DFO) who entered this information into a master table.

June 28, 2010:

Mr. Ed Hanlon, the DFO, opened the meeting, and made a brief opening statement noting that the STAA is a Federal Advisory Committee under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA). He noted the meeting and teleconference was closed to the public because it was concerned with selecting which employees are deserving of awards, a personnel matter with privacy concerns, which is exempt from public disclosure pursuant to section 10(d) of FACA and section (c)(6) of the Government in the Sunshine Act. He noted that the SAB Staff Office had assessed whether there were any conflict-of-interest or appearance of a lack of impartiality issues for any of the STAA committee members for this review. He noted that in the case where conflicts or potential conflicts of interest, or appearance of a lack of impartiality issues existed, Committee members would recuse themselves from the review and discussion process. Mr. Hanlon also noted that minutes were being taken to summarize discussions and action items in accordance with requirements under FACA. Dr. Vanessa Vu also welcomed everyone for their attendance

and participation. Mr. Hanlon then turned the meeting over to the Chair, Dr. Taylor Eighmy.

Dr. Eighmy welcomed everyone and noted there were two new members to the Committee (Drs. Peter Chapman and Wayne Landis). He also noted this was an Advisory effort where a report seeking consensus would be prepared.

At the start of the closed meeting, the Committee discussed ORD's request that the STAA Committee undertake a pilot study to review EPA Project and Research Reports as part of the traditional STAA review process. Seventeen nominations were within a category entitled "EPA Project and Research Reports." The STAA Committee elected to not undertake this pilot project nor to review these seventeen nominations within this 'EPA Project and Research Reports' review category. The Committee recommended that the Agency use or establish other mechanisms to recognize the authors of major EPA reports that advance the scientific knowledge critical to EPA's mission.

The Committee then discussed each nomination and the reviewers' initial rankings were verbalized and recorded. Each nomination was assigned to at least two Committee members for review. In any instance where there was a significant difference between recommendations for award, the nomination was slated for additional review by one or more Committee members, and reserved for later discussion by the Committee members.

June 29, 2010:

The Committee continued discussion on each nomination and the reviewers' initial rankings were verbalized and recorded, until all nominations received initial rankings by the Committee.

June 30, 2010:

The Committee continued discussion on each nomination and the reviewers' initial rankings were verbalized and recorded, until all nominations received initial rankings by the Committee.

The Committee discussed widely divergent rankings and bundling of nominations, and combined fourteen nominations into seven nominations due to topic similarities of publications within the nominations. The Committee compared their initial rankings, category by category, and reviewed the final award recommendations from the previous several years of STAA awards to provide a level of comfort that the Committee had "calibrated" its initial recommendations correctly. The Committee also considered nominations which had been flagged for further discussion and a few other nominations which the Committee Members wished to reconsider.

The Committee then led a discussion that reviewed all rankings for each nomination, and developed Committee consensus on the final recommendations for awards.

Of the 128 nominations reviewed, the SAB recommended 61 nominations for monetary awards and another 33 deserving of honorable mention. Of the nominations recommended for monetary awards, 5 were recommended for Level I, the highest award; 14 for Level II; and 42 for Level III awards.

The Committee identified comments it wished to make to the Agency in the final report accompanying its recommendations.

After Drs. Vu and Eighmy thanked the members for their efforts, the meeting was adjourned at 11:20 am.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as True:

/signed/

/signed/

Mr. Edward Hanlon
Designated Federal Officer
Scientific and Technological
Achievement Award Committee

Dr. Taylor Eighmy, Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this closed meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Committee members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Committee members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the meeting.

Attachments:

A. 2010 SAB STAA Committee Roster

Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the SAB website:

<http://www.epa.gov/sab>, at the June 28-30, 2010 meeting website:

<http://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/a84bfee16cc358ad85256ccd006b0b4b/1873a5efdacf9a32852576c0005c87aa!OpenDocument&Date=2010-06-29>

¹ Federal Register Notice announcing the meeting.

Attachment A: 2010 SAB STAA Committee Roster

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Science Advisory Board Scientific and Technological Achievement Awards (STAA) Committee

CHAIR

Dr. T. Taylor Eighmy, Vice President for Research, Office of the Vice President for Research, Texas Tech University, Lubbock, TX

MEMBERS

Dr. James Bus, Director of External Technology, Toxicology and Environmental Research and Consulting, The Dow Chemical Company, Midland, MI

Dr. Peter Chapman, Principal and Senior Environmental Scientist, Golder Associates Ltd., Burnaby, BC, Canada

Dr. John P. Giesy, Professor and Canada Research Chair in Environmental Toxicology, Department of Veterinary Biomedical Sciences and Toxicology Centre, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon, Canada; and Emeritus Distinguished Professor of Zoology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI

Dr. Cynthia M. Harris, Director and Professor, Institute of Public Health, Florida A&M University, Tallahassee, FL

Dr. Dale Hattis, Research Professor with the George Perkins Marsh Institute, Clark University, Worcester, MA

Dr. Michael T. Kleinman, Professor and Co-Director of the Air Pollution Health Effects Laboratory, Department of Medicine, Division of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, University of California, Irvine, Irvine, CA

Dr. Wayne Landis, Professor and Director, Institute of Environmental Toxicology, Huxley College of the Environment, Western Washington University, Bellingham, WA

Dr. Desmond F. Lawler, Distinguished Teaching Professor and Bob R. Dorsey Professor of Engineering, Department of Civil, Architectural and Environmental Engineering, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX

Reid Lifset, Associate Director of the Industrial Environmental Management Program and Resident Fellow in Industrial Ecology, School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University, New Haven, CT

Dr. Randy Maddalena, Scientist, Environmental Energy Technologies Division,
Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA

Dr. Paulette Middleton, Creator and President, Panorama Pathways, Boulder, CO

Dr. Fred J. Miller, Independent Consultant, Fred J. Miller and Associates LLC, Cary,
NC

Dr. John R. Smith, Division Manager, Environmental Science and Sustainable
Technology, Alcoa Inc., Alcoa Center, PA

Dr. Robert Twiss, Professor of Environmental Planning Emeritus, University of
California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA

Dr. Yousheng Zeng, Air Quality Services Director, Providence Engineering and
Environmental Group LLC, Baton Rouge, LA

Dr. Barbara Zielinska, Research Professor and Director, Organic Analytical
Laboratory, Division of Atmospheric Sciences, Desert Research Institute (DRI), Reno,
NV

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Mr. Edward Hanlon, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
1400R, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-564-2134, Fax: 202-565-2098
(hanlon.edward@epa.gov)